

BOARD OF REVISION

The Geauga County Board of Revision met on Monday, August 27, 2018, at 8:58 a.m. in the Auditor's Conference Room on the first floor of the Courthouse Annex.

Present: County Auditor Charles E. Walder, County Commissioner Timothy C. Lennon, County Treasurer Christopher P. Hitchcock (part) and Chief Deputy County Treasurer Caroline Mansfield (part).

Also Present: Chief Appraiser Chris Greenawalt and Deputy Auditor Mary Kolcum

GENERAL BUSINESS

Remissions/Refunds of Late Payment Penalties per ORC 5711.33 and 5711.39

Motioned by Charles E. Walder and seconded by Timothy C. Lennon to remit and/or refund the following late payment penalties totaling \$19.03 due to reasonable cause and not willful neglect and based upon the recommendation of the County Treasurer Christopher P. Hitchcock:

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

1. Gaul, Rachel	30-039750	\$5.81
	30-079200	\$13.22
	Totaling	\$19.03

Motioned by Charles E. Walder, seconded by Timothy C. Lennon to deny the remission of late payment penalties totaling \$235.04 upon the recommendation of County Treasurer Christopher P. Hitchcock due to previous late payments.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

1. Chester, Lisa	26-049000	\$235.04 DENIED
------------------	-----------	-----------------

Pending Cases

10-056900 Park Centre LLC

Case was tabled, due to delayed appraisal paperwork presented the day of hearing.

Tax Year 2017 Valuation Complaints Formal Hearings begin as Scheduled

Let the record note the hearings are digitally recorded.

21-176538 Best Sand Corporation, Counter filed by Chardon LSD

Auditor Walder swore in Dale Markowitz, Attorney, and Peter T. Zawadski, School Attorney. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$22,600 yet he feels it is worth \$1,500,000 and the Board asked him to explain why the value should be increased.

Best Sand and Chardon LSD negotiated an amount of \$350,000. Chris Greenawalt stated the Auditor's valuation is based on surface value.

Action

After a review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Charles E. Walder, seconded by Timothy C. Lennon to increase the market value for Tax Year 2017 from \$22,600 to \$350,000 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

10-165769 Love Properties Management LLC Counter filed by Chardon LSD

Auditor Walder swore in James Love, owner and Peter T. Zawadski, School Attorney. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$995,900 yet he feels it is worth \$933,000 and the Board asked him to explain why the value should be decreased.

O'Reily's Auto Store valuation is \$244,900, contractor purchased 3 acre parcel for \$270,000. Construction and repairs cost \$179,000, after completed construction the net profit was \$200,000. Two comps were presented by owner including appraisal at \$300,000 with improvement by construction of a new building. Building interior was under construction in 2017, took 3 years to build out. Chris Greenawalt ran comparables and a Proforma calculation.

Action

After a review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Christopher P. Hitchcock, seconded by Timothy C. Lennon to decrease the market value for Tax Year 2017 from \$995,900 to \$989,900 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

10-056900 Park Centre LLC Counter filed by Chardon LSD

Auditor Walder swore in Ken Frank, managing member, Joe Svete, Attorney, Vic Cizek, Broker for Realty Net, Dale McGriffin, Appraiser and Peter T. Zawadski, School Attorney. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$643,000 yet he feels it is worth \$500,000, and the Board asked him to explain why the value should be decreased.

Action

Hearing was tabled due to evidence submitted less than five business days prior to the hearing. Evidence was presented the day of the hearing and will be rescheduled after evidence has been reviewed by The Board of Revision.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

10-042510 & 10-042511 Maple Grove Residential LLC, Counter filed by Chardon LSD

Auditor Walder swore in Phil Smith, owner and Peter T. Zawadski, School Attorney. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcels in question valued at \$225,100 yet the school feels they are worth \$425,000 and the Board asked him to explain why the value should be not be increased.

Mr. Zawadski filed on behalf of the Chardon School Board, regarding an Arm's Length Transaction. Mr. Smith stated the property has been under construction for repair, removal and improvements of property and structures. Property is not receiving income, but future profit expected. Chris Greenawalt did a field check and inspection on the property. Chris Greenawalt also noted for the record, that a reduction in value of 75% for Tax Year 2017 was approved following a Destroyed Property Form filed on 7/5/2017 due to dwelling demolition.

Action

After a review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Christopher P. Hitchcock, seconded by Charles E. Walder to not increase the market value for Tax Year 2017 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

10-031900, 10-032000, 10-032100, 10-032200, 10-032300, 10-165323, 10-165324, 10-165325, 10-165326 100 Chardon LLC & Cuyahoga Chardon LLC, Counter filed by Chardon LSD

Auditor Walder swore in Lindsay Spillman, Attorney, Kevin Morar, Appraiser and Peter T. Zawadski, School Attorney. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcels in question valued at \$743,400 yet the owner feels they are worth \$470,000 and the Board asked them to explain why the value should be decreased.

Attorney Spillman questioned appraiser Morar about his qualifications and experience. Appraiser Morar described property, presented pictures, vacancy percentage and appraisal methods based on income approach, capitalization, value approach and favored income approach. Proforma appraisal based on sales comparable and interior inspection gave a value of \$452,000. Mr. Zawadski went over a comparable property. Chris Greenawalt did field check and interior inspection on property with findings of 1st floor occupied by a bank, 2nd floor in decent shape and 3rd floor was under construction. Thirteen tenants currently occupy the building.

Action

After review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Timothy C. Lennon, seconded by Charles E. Walder to decrease the market value for Tax Year 2017 from \$537,400 to \$389,000 for parcel 10-032300 and not decrease the market value for all other parcels valued at \$206,000 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Christopher P. Hitchcock, Timothy C. Lennon. Motion carried.

11-306000 Mikonsky, Dennis P & Lori L

Auditor Walder swore in Chris Greenawalt Geauga County Chief Appraiser. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$178,300 yet owner feels it is worth \$147,300 and the Board asked for explanation why the value should be decreased.

Chris Greenawalt represented owner, as they were not present for the hearing. Ranch style home with attached and detached garage located in Chester Township. Chris goes over his 3 comparables with an average value of \$201,783.

Action

After review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Timothy C. Lennon, seconded by Caroline Mansfield to not decrease the market value for Tax Year 2017 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Timothy C. Lennon and Caroline Mansfield. Motion carried.

19-071459 Middlefield Elderly Housing LP

Auditor Walder swore in Lindsey Speelman, Attorney, Kelly Meszaros, Regional Management Property. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$818,700 yet the owner feels it is worth \$640,000 and the Board asked them to explain why the value should be decreased. The original requested value was amended by Attorney Speelman to the amount of \$650,000 which was noted on record.

Kelly Meszaros presented information on the Middlefield Elderly property built in 1990 originally owned by Hudson Properties then sold to Middlefield Property on transfer June 3, 2008. Property is made up of 4 buildings with 36 multiple sized units. Company is USDA funded and rental rate cap is decided by Rural Development. Chris Greenawalt spoke on calculations based on the cap provided.

Action

After review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Timothy C. Lennon, seconded by Caroline Mansfield to not decrease the market value for Tax Year 2017 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Timothy C. Lennon and Caroline Mansfield. Motion carried.

19-071425 Geauga Elderly Housing LP

Auditor Walder swore in Lindsey Speelman, Attorney, Kelly Meszaros, Regional Management Property. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$1,095,600 yet the owner feels it is worth \$700,000 and the Board asked them to explain why the value should be decreased.

Kelly Meszaros presented information on the Geauga Elderly Housing property built in 1984 and remodeled in 2009. Property has 40 multiple sized senior housing units funded by USDA with a rental rate cap range of \$401.00-\$475.00 decided by Rural Development. Chris Greenawalt stated on 12/13/14 the BTA ruled on the amount of \$948,000 based on evidence provided from the Board of Revision.

Action

After review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Timothy C. Lennon, seconded by Caroline Mansfield to not decrease the market value for Tax Year 2017 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Timothy C. Lennon and Caroline Mansfield. Motion carried.

19-021500 Shasta Properties LLC

Auditor Walder swore in Mark Dolezal, owner and his attorney. Auditor Walder noted for the record that the Auditor's office has the parcel in question valued at \$635,500 yet the owner feels it is worth \$400,000 and the Board asked them to explain why the value should be decreased.

Attorney stated a previously filed BOR on Aug. 24, 2017 decreased the value from \$795,900 to \$425,000, less than 30 days later owner received a re-valuation letter raising the value to \$821,400. Spoke to Joe Aveny that appraised value at \$635,500. Mark Dolezal provides exhibits from prior testimony showing vacancy in building then and no change in 2017. Mark provided formula calculations using Income Approach. Chris Greenawalt ran comparables and Proforma. Increased value went up due to profit in 2016 which is why 2017 taxes increased.

Action

After review of all the testimony and all the other information available it was motioned by Charles E. Walder, seconded by Timothy C. Lennon to not decrease the market value for Tax Year 2017 based on evidence presented.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Timothy C. Lennon and Caroline Mansfield. Motion carried.

11-338000 Premier Bank & Trust (Dollar General)

Cardinal LSD and Premier Bank agreed to a signed stipulation of \$1,125,000.

Action

It was motioned by Charles E. Walder, seconded by Timothy C. Lennon to accept the agreed stipulation between both parties.

Voice vote, three ayes. Charles E. Walder, Timothy C. Lennon and Caroline Mansfield. Motion carried.

Being no further business to conduct it was moved by Charles E. Walder to adjourn the August 27, 2018 BOR meeting at 3:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Charles E. Walder, Auditor
Secretary/Board of Revision

